

Public Document Pack

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th
February, 2020 at 2.00 pm**

PRESENT: County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: J.Becker, L.Brown, A.Davies, D. Dovey, A. Easson, D. Evans, M.Feakins, R. Harris, J. Higginson, G. Howard, P. Murphy, M. Powell, A. Webb, S. Woodhouse, R.John and R.Roden attended the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chair.

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Craig O'Connor	Head of Planning
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Andrew Jones	Development Management Area Team Manager
Amy Longford	Heritage Manager
Denzil – John Turbevill	Commercial Solicitor
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

County Councillors A. Easson and A Webb left the meeting following determination of applications DM/2019/01041 and DM/2019/01629 (which were considered together) and did not return.

APOLOGIES:

County Councillor R. Edwards

1. Declarations of Interest

None.

2. Confirmation of Minutes

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 3rd December 2019 were confirmed and signed by the Vice-Chair.

3. Application DC/2018/00218 - Retention of timber close boarded fence on south boundary, and raise level of no. 21 garden between 120mm and 810mm over the fence length. 21 Jasper Tudor Crescent Abergavenny NP7 9AZ

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the four conditions as outlined in the report.

Mrs. H. Trotman, objecting to the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chair and outlined the following points:

- In August 2017 the applicant had built a breeze block wall along the full length of the mutual boundary.
- A new six feet six inches fence had been placed on top of the wall which raised the boundary level to 2.7 metres in height which breached permitted

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

development permission. This has been in place for two and a half years, severely impacting on her residential amenity.

- No prior consultation had been sought and it was considered by the objector that trespass would have been required to undertake the build, breaching the party wall act.
- The objector considered that the applicant has breached the David Wilson restrictive covenants by not gaining written approval from the local authority prior to development.
- As time progressed the ground works were causing harm to the objector's land. It was considered that the applicant had altered the natural flow of the land leaving the objector's garden water logged.
- The wall has caused a damming affect and subsequent severe pooling of water with nowhere for the water to drain away to.
- The applicant has raised the level of earth on his side of the boundary that is higher than the wall resulting in an overspill of sod and earth into the objector's garden.
- A meeting was held on 10th October 2019 involving all parties and it had been agreed that harm was being caused to the objector's property. The objector had been asked to draw up a plan indicating a system of drainage to attempt to resolve the problem at her cost.
- At a previous meeting, it had been suggested that a French drainage system could be installed which would alleviate the drainage issues. A plan had been drawn up on this advice. The plan provided a system of drainage for properties numbered 19 and 21 running the full length of both boundaries. This would be linked into the objector's storm drain on her property. This had been agreed by all present at the meeting.
- Access was granted to the objector's property to undertake this work. During the work, the objector considered that the applicant had failed to install the drainage pipe on the side of the objector's garden. The objector had not been advised of this change of plan. Therefore, the water continues to pool as it has nowhere to drain.
- Flooding also occurs on the objector's patio. The works undertaken have failed to address the harm being caused to the objector's property.
- Without a perforated pipe being installed on the objector's side of the boundary there will be no improvement, as the levels constructed by the applicant are alien to the original development.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- The density of the applicant's chippings has further exacerbated the flooding problems. Damage to the objector's garden in this area is severe.
- The objector owned her property for over a year from new before the applicant had built the wall. During this time there had been a severe winter and no flooding had occurred.
- The raising of the ground has impacted on the objector's residential amenity and continues to do so.
- On legal advice, the objector has withdrawn her good will gesture to allow the applicant to have access to her storm drain.
- No guarantees have been given by the applicant with regard to any of the work that has taken place.
- The objector is concerned that the value of her property is being affected by the applicant's actions who considers that adequate steps to prevent damage to the objector's property have not been taken.
- With regard to the fence, there is a detrimental effect to the objector's property. The current height is 2.7 metres. The applicant's revision indicates that the top 30 cm will now be replaced by trellis. However, this would still take the fence above regulated height.
- The objector considers that the options available will have a negative impact on her property.
- The objector asked the Planning Committee to consider refusal of the application and that the wall and fence be removed with the ground being returned to its original level.

The applicant was given an opportunity to respond but declined the offer.

The local Member for Llanfoist Fawr, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the following points:

- The local Member has no objection in principle to the land being raised. However, it could have been undertaken better without the need for a second fence and without exacerbating existing drainage issues.
- It was hoped that a resolution had been agreed between both parties. However, this had not been the case.
- There is perceived harm being done to the objector's property which is a material concern. Therefore, the local Member stated that he found it difficult to support the application without the issues surrounding the second drain being rectified.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

Having considered the report of the application and noting the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- Monmouthshire County Council's Drainage Engineer has investigated the work that has been undertaken and had indicated that the work carried out will, in time, mitigate the circumstances. The Authority has done what it can to remedy the situation.
- The applicant's garden had been raised by 700 mm which takes the party fence up to 2.7 metres, which is above the two metres regulated height.
- The poor drainage will cause problems for the original party fence, which will rot over time. There will be issues over who is responsible for maintaining the original fence having had another fence erected on the inside of the original fence.
- Any extension to the party fence will be unsightly. The policy of permitted development should be protected by disallowing any raising of gardens which will change the nature of the ecology of the neighbouring properties.
- The drainage issues have not been satisfactorily resolved. Further investigations are required.
- There is no definitive evidence that the unfortunate condition of the garden of property number 19 is entirely as a consequence of the ground works undertaken at property number 21. It is not within the gift of the Local Planning Authority to find a solution within the red line boundary. The solution to the drainage issues has only been installed for a few months and has not yet had an opportunity to prove its effectiveness.

It was proposed by County Councillor G. Howard and seconded by County Councillor A. Easson that we be minded to refuse application DC/2018/00218 on the grounds of lack of evidence that harm to a neighbouring property has been resolved.

Upon being put to the vote 10 Members of the Planning Committee voted in favour of the proposal to refuse the application. The proposition was therefore carried.

We resolved that we be minded to refuse application DC/2018/00218 on the grounds of lack of evidence that harm to a neighbouring property has been resolved. The application will be re-presented to a future Planning Committee meeting with appropriate reasons for refusal.

4. Application DM/2019/00898 - New detached two storey dwelling with integral garage and driveway access from highway with on-site parking and turning. Land to rear Of Rosemary, Beaufort Road, Osbaston, Monmouth

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the seven conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement.

The local Member for Dixton with Osbaston attended the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chair and outlined the following points. He addressed the Planning Committee as the local Member and as a member of Monmouth Town Council Planning Committee.

- Monmouth Town Council Planning Committee had discussed the application and noted that the week before the meeting took place to discuss the application, Monmouthshire County Council Planning Department had made a recommendation to approve the proposed development. Concern was expressed that Monmouthshire Planning Department appeared to not consider the views of the Town Council and therefore not incorporate the Town Council's views into the report of the application.
- Monmouth Town Council considers that its role is to represent local residents. Questions have been asked as to whether there is any point in having a Monmouth Town Council Planning Committee if its views are not provided for Members of the Monmouthshire County Council's Planning Committee to consider.
- Monmouth Town Council Planning Committee considers that the process in respect of this application has been rushed. Ordinarily, the Town Council has 21 days in which to respond to a planning application. However, in this case only 14 days were provided.
- The Committee was unable to approve the application today. It could only recommend approval due to the consultation end date being 7th February 2020. Unfortunately, as the planning portal has been off line for a period of time the local Member is unable to verify this. Clarity is required before the application is considered.
- A deferment of the application had been requested to allow the local Member to gather information from residents. However, this had not been granted.
- Monmouth Town Council considers that the process has undermined local democracy. Monmouth Town Council Planning Committee is considering disbanding.
- A Welsh Government Inspector had turned down an appeal against a similar style of development on a larger plot about 50 metres away about 15 years ago. The reasons for overturning this previous application would apply equally to the current application being considered today.
- Beaufort Road has had little development in the intervening years, retaining its original character.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- The piecemeal development taking place leads to, over time, a radical and harmful change to the character of Dixton with Osbaston.
- To reach Beaufort Road there are three routes. All of these routes are of a sizable length of single track road, all impassable for two cars to pass. Therefore, vehicles are required to reverse or use residents' drives to allow vehicles to pass. Piecemeal developments have exacerbated this problem.
- The proposed development is too far to walk to senior schools. There are no shops or surgeries in the area which results in an unnecessarily high dependence on the use of cars.
- Pavements are few in number which hinders walking along this route.
- The proposed development does not make a positive contribution to the creation of distinctive communities. There is a risk that the character of the area will be adversely effected.
- Approval of the application will result in damage to wildlife, the flood risk will be exacerbated and there will be an increase in danger for pedestrians and cyclists.
- The local Member asked that the Planning Committee considers refusal of the application for the reasons identified.

Mr. J. Craig, representing objectors, attended the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chair and outlined the following points:

- The proposal has received in excess of 60 objections which underlines the level of concern.
- The proposal is not a desirable and appropriate application and it does not conform to the Local Development Plan.
- Monmouth Town Council has voted on two separate occasions to refuse the application.
- The application does not meet with Central Government's Planning process which is to avoid garden grabbing, reducing amenity, harmony of the ecological system and places an unwelcome burden on local infrastructure.
- The application does not meet desirable street scene consideration being a tandem development.
- In the previous 12 months, two local applications were declined for the same reasons.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- There are two examples of more acceptable use of garden developments which had been approved in the locality. These are side by side developments and not behind one another.
- The application does not improve the character and amenity of Osbaston. It is considered not to be a building necessity as there is a substantial development of new houses in Monmouth.
- If the application was approved, concern was expressed that further applications of a similar nature will be presented to Planning Committee for approval.
- There is a current lack of safe play areas in Osbaston.
- There is a danger that Osbaston was losing its uniqueness and was becoming a high density area.
- Welsh Government has indicated that climate change is a priority. Concern was expressed that existing infrastructure will not cope with anticipated adverse weather conditions, going forward. Flooding already occurs in the gardens of existing properties adjacent to the plot.
- With regard to access, the frontage is narrow hindering construction vehicles.
- There are no adequate pavements for pedestrians with no safe routes to school.
- Access to the property is via a single track lane resulting, on occasions, in some vehicles having to reverse 'blind' into Beaufort Road.
- The Highways Department is confident that one more dwelling will not adversely affect traffic flows. However, it was considered that no account of local conditions had been accounted for.
- There are no local shops, surgeries or play areas.
- There is very little parking provision for delivery vehicles. Visitors to the area will park on Beaufort Road causing traffic blocking, which already occurs on this road. Parking overspill already occurs with vehicles using pavements at Beaufort Road.
- The application contravenes the Welsh Government's spatial plan, does not respect the distinctiveness of the community and does not protect residential property.

The applicant's agent, Mr. G. Buckle, attended the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chair and outlined the following points:

- The site covers an area of 700 square metres which is more than adequate to support one dwelling.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- The proposed new property has been designed to fit into the existing site and sits comfortably on the plot.
- The design takes into account neighbours' comments and comments raised in respect of ecology and biodiversity.
- The existing water course along the south eastern boundary of the site is to remain undisturbed ensuring that the existing wildlife habitat is maintained.
- The existing hedgerow and trees will form a screen for the existing properties in Duchess Road, to the south east.
- Access to the site is from Beaufort Road. It is proposed to demolish the existing garage and provide a new permeable driveway which will provide parking for a minimum of three vehicles serving the new dwelling and establish a turning area which will enable vehicles to enter and leave the site in a forward direction.
- The new driveway will provide access for the host property providing turning areas within the site.
- Every reasonable objection submitted has been addressed via careful redesign and providing expert ecological and landscape reports.
- Surface water drainage from the site will comply with Welsh Office legislation and will be subject to sustainable drainage proposals which will include rainwater harvesting.
- The application site is located within the development site of Monmouth and is in an area which has been developed extensively over the previous 50 years.
- When the applicant had purchased the property it stood alone in open fields.
- The proposed dwelling sits comfortably on the plot and within the surrounding area.
- There are numerous mixed designs in the area and the proposed development works well within its setting.
- The proposed development will use traditional materials. Being linked with a substantial landscape proposal will aid the development in fitting into the surrounding area.
- Amendments to the proposed development have been made following the concerns raised by neighbours and the potential impact minimised. There are no first floor habitable windows facing neighbouring properties and the proposed dwelling is almost in line with the adjacent property.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- The overall height of the building has been reduced and is lower than the ridge of Charles Close. Also, the double garage has been replaced with a single garage.
- The existing tree belt and landscaping to the south east is to be retained with no adverse overlooking issues to the neighbouring properties.
- The applicant had appointed specialist ecologists to ensure that the proposals meet the biodiversity requirements. The proposal provides ecological enhancement with the inclusion of native species hedgerows.
- The applicant has provided all of the necessary information required by the Local Planning Authority, including boundary ownership, to confirm that the application site is able to accommodate the proposed dwelling and provides the required parking and turning areas.
- The proposal makes good use of brownfield land and adds a new, much needed sustainable property in the housing stock of Monmouthshire.
- The proposed dwelling fully complies with the recently adopted Supplementary Planning Guidance in respect of infill development.
- The proposed dwelling is a good design and totally sustainable.

Having received the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- The application had been submitted in June 2019, whereby, the Planning Department had undertaken a 21 day consultation period. Monmouth Town Council had responded on 12th August 2019 outlining its concerns.
- As a result of the comments received, the scheme had been amended significantly and had been reduced in scale and size. Amended plans had been sent to neighbouring residents and to Monmouth Town Council for comment. A full consultation process had been undertaken.
- In response to a question raised regarding the access gradient, it was noted that Supplementary Planning Guidance states that the gradient should ideally be no steeper than 1:10 subject to a maximum gradient of 1:8. The Planning Department has discussed with the agent and it is proposed to add an additional condition on the consent for full site sections (cross section and long section) to ensure that the gradients are appropriate.
- Concern was expressed regarding the design of the proposed development, that it does not sit well within the surrounding area and that it affects the local amenity of the area.
- The applicant had complied with planning policies leaving no reason to refuse the application.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- The proposed dwelling was in keeping with the scale of the surrounding area.
- The proposed new dwelling will have a rainwater harvesting system to collect and store rainwater and make use of it to flush toilets and supply washing machines. There will be little, if any water discharging into the ground to soak away. The driveway will consist of a permeable surface to avoid water run-off. All surface water will be managed on site.
- The proposal is for one additional dwelling. Table four identifies the minimum access as 2.75 metres. The plans identify that as 3.5 metres. Therefore, the access is over the minimum required for one individual plot.
- The Highways Department has considered the gradient and access and consider it to be acceptable.
- An affordable housing contribution will be received in the sum of £8,000.
- There are windows at the rear of the property Llys-Wen. However, the front elevation of the proposed dwelling is 5.8 metres at an angle from the rear corner of Llys-Wen to the front corner of the garage diagonally. Therefore, the whole aspect of the front of the proposal looks forward to Beaufort Road and Llys-Wen looks behind to the boundary. There will be no overlooking issues.
- From the rear of Llys-Wen to the corner of the proposed dwelling at a 45 degree angle, it is 16 metres. The proposed dwelling sits at a lower level to the existing dwelling. Therefore, it is considered that there will be no adverse impact on residential amenity.
- There is a large buffer from the front of Beaufort Road to the rear of the property which shares the boundary between Llys-Wen, the proposed dwelling and Rosemary which is an existing boundary. It is proposed that this be replaced with a native hedge with the fence being retained in its existing position. There will be a significant amount of screening between the existing property and the proposed dwelling.
- A Construction Management Plan will be added as a pre-commencement condition.
- None of the existing trees enclosed by the protective fence shall be felled, lopped or topped and are protected by condition 6.

The local Member for Dixton with Osbaston summed up, as follows:

- The local Member refuted that objections have been sufficiently mitigated.
- The proposed dwelling is out of keeping and harms visual amenity.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- The proposed development will be visible from many houses in this area of Osbaston as it is located at the bottom of the valley.
- It would adversely impact the quality of the environment and visual amenity for many walkers.
- The access from the proposed development is directly onto a narrow lane with no visibility from the left side. Access is dangerous.
- Drainage is an issue within the local area. Various levellings could create an adverse impact on drainage in the area.
- Lack of parking provision could cause danger to pedestrians.
- The local Member asked the Planning Committee to consider refusal of the application.

It was proposed by County Councillor R. Harris and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DM/2019/00898 be approved subject to the seven conditions outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement. Also, that additional conditions be added to include full site sections (cross section and long section) to ensure that the gradients are appropriate as well as arranging a planting scheme.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	10
Against the proposal	-	1
Abstentions	-	4

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00898 be approved subject to the seven conditions outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement. Also, that additional conditions be added to include full site sections (cross section and long section) to ensure that the gradients are appropriate as well as arranging a planting scheme.

5. Application DM/2018/00374 - Construction of seven dwellings and associated works. Land At Woodbine Field, Monmouth Road, Usk

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the 14 conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement.

In noting the detail of the application, the following points were identified:

- The Committee welcomed the application.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- In response to a question raised regarding electric charging points, the Head of Planning stated that significant considerations are being given to how the Authority deals with climate change mitigation in the replacement Local Development Plan.
- It was agreed that an additional condition should be added to agree external finishes.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor A. Webb that application DM/2018/00374 be approved subject to the 14 conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement. Also, that an additional condition be added to agree external finishes.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	14
Against the proposal	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2018/00374 be approved subject to the 14 conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement. Also, that an additional condition be added to agree external finishes.

6. Application DM/2018/01720 - Alterations and conversion of existing agricultural buildings to form two bedroom dwelling unit with ancillary works. Worthybrook Farm, Old Hendre Road, Wonastow, Monmouth

We received the report of the application and late correspondence which was presented for refusal subject to the two reasons outlined in the report.

The local Member for Mitchel Troy attended the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chair and outlined the following points:

- This is a re-submitted application that has been significantly changed. It has been reduced in scale by over 50%.
- The defective outbuildings had been omitted from the latest submission.
- A consulting engineer's report on the buildings to be retained within this development are deemed suitable for conversion and considered to be in serviceable condition.
- This application has given full consideration to the rural setting both in terms of its design and finishing.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- The application does not have the modern, urban style and characteristics of the previous application.
- The re-submission proposes to lower the floor level of the building by adopting an underpinning exercise to accommodate a two storey element. The underpinning is not untypical of barn conversions and will enhance the foundations of the existing stone walls.
- It also increases the scale and the usable space in the building.
- The Planning Department had indicated that it would support conversion of the buildings as a holiday let. However, the local Member expressed concern as the appearance, design and scale of the development would be the same for residential use.
- The applicant's agent has drawn attention to a number of similar developments which have been granted planning permission. The applicant considered that the Authority could be seen to be inconsistent having approved similar applications for conversions of ancillary structures.
- The development, which includes an original stone barn structure, together with conversion of ancillary buildings built in the 1950s, would not be deemed modern in accordance with planning records.
- If the application is refused, it is likely that the applicant will consider submitting a formal appeal.
- The application has received many letters of support from nearby neighbours and from Mitchel Troy Community Council which recognises the need for affordable housing provision in rural Monmouthshire.
- The proposed development meets all supplementary planning guidelines.
- There have been no local objections to the proposed development.
- Development of this site for residential use would visually enhance the area and would ensure that the buildings currently falling into disrepair would be removed.
- If the site is not developed, it will continue to be an eyesore.
- Neighbours recognise that this would be a conversion to bring these buildings, currently in poor condition, back into use as a home.
- The local Member asked the Planning Committee to consider approval of the application.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- There is not enough stonework or architectural merit to the buildings to allow conversion to take place for a residential dwelling.
- It would result in development in the countryside in an unsustainable location outside of the settlement boundary.
- The application is against planning policy.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Powell and seconded by County Councillor G. Howard that application DM/2018/01720 be refused for the two reasons outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	13
Against refusal	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2018/01720 be refused for the two reasons outlined in the report.

7. Application DM/2019/01041 - Reserved matters application for the erection of 271 dwellings with ancillary works. Land Development South Of Crick Road, Portskewett and Application DM/2019/01629 - Application for reserved matters pursuant to DM/2018/00696 relating to Layout, Scale, Appearance of Buildings, Means of Access (where not already approved) and Landscaping for the construction of a care home and associated works. Land Development South Of Crick Road, Crick Road, Portskewett

We considered the reports of the applications and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the reports.

In doing so, the following points were noted:

- The Committee thanked the officers for their hard work in preparing the two applications for consideration. Support was received for the residential properties and for the care home. Both applications will complement the area.
- An additional condition could be added to retain parking spaces for parking purposes only.
- A further additional condition could be added to remove permitted development rights for roof extensions.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- The construction traffic management plan was conditioned in the outline application. This application is for reserved matters.
- In terms of bus provision, there was a £50,000 contribution within the Section 106 Agreement for this site to be used in improving the local bus services. How that is used is a decision to be made by the Local Council's Transport Department where assessments will be made to determine where the improvements need to be made. Planning Officers could liaise with the Transport Department and the Estates Department to ascertain whether it is proposed to provide additional bus stops on this site.
- The site has been designed with permeability in mind with cycling and pedestrian links being provided. Funding is available from the Section 106 funding to develop the railway line.

It was proposed by County Councillor J. Higginson and seconded by County Councillor A. Easson that applications DM/2019/01041 and DM/2019/01629 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the reports. Also, that the following conditions be added:

- The condition outlined in late correspondence regarding pumping station details.
- To retain parking spaces for parking purposes only.
- To remove permitted development rights for roof alterations.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	14
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that applications DM/2019/01041 and DM/2019/01629 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the reports. Also, that the following conditions be added:

- The condition outlined in late correspondence regarding pumping station details.
- To retain parking spaces for parking purposes only.
- To remove permitted development rights for roof alterations.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th
February, 2020 at 2.00 pm**

8. Application DM/2019/01480 - Change of use of land to accommodate two park homes and up to four touring caravans - Traveller needs (private family site only). Land Adjacent Sunnybank, A48 Crick to Parkwall Roundabout, Crick, Monmouthshire

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the seven conditions outlined in the report.

In doing so, the following points were noted:

- Excavation work has taken place on the site and concern was raised that the land at the rear of the site may now be unstable with the removal of trees, vegetation and stones. This might need to be investigated before approval of the application is considered.
- Concern was expressed that the amount of proposed development would result in overdevelopment of the site, particularly when the touring vehicles are on site.
- The site adjoins Border Waste Crick. This site had not been granted planning permission as there was a concern regarding land slippage towards the motorway.
- Concern was expressed that the excavation work might adversely affect the residential safety of the applicant and his family as there might be the potential for a landslip at the site.
- Mathern Community Council had looked at Planning Policy H8 and consider that the application does not meet the requirements of the policy. It was considered that the site was not large enough to house the proposed development resulting in overdevelopment of the site. It was considered that not all of the site was suitable for development.
- Under the parking policy, the two park homes, as the residential units, will require five parking places. A turning area should be required in order to allow vehicles to leave the site in a forward gear when joining the highway.
- Caravan model conditions outline the need for a six metre gap between caravans and mobile homes due their flammable nature.
- The local Authority has undertaken a gypsy and traveller assessment and it has been outlined that there is a need for eight sites around the County.
- This site is privately owned and the applicant for this site falls within the assessment. The applicant has established a need to find a home within the County. This site would provide that need.
- The site has been looked at in terms of Policy H8 and it was established that the development meets that criteria.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- It is situated in a sustainable location.
- The visual amenity is considered to be acceptable.
- The highway safety aspect has been investigated and it has been identified that visibility is good from the site.
- In terms of the proposed amount of development on the site, if it is considered to be over development of the site, the applicant has indicated that he would be willing to have just the two park homes on the site for himself and his son, which would be a personal consent for him and his family to have a home within the County.
- With regard to the excavation work at the rear of the site, the applicant had indicated to the Planning Department that he had not undertaken any work which required planning consent. The removal of trees and landscaping does not require planning consent. However, if the Committee had concerns, there could be a pre-commencement condition added to ensure the stability and safety of the land at the rear of the site.
- The Environmental Health Department had indicated that a caravan licence would be required.
- This is a privately owned site.
- Removal of the four touring caravans would alleviate the issues regarding over development of the site.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that application DM/2019/01480 be approved subject to the seven conditions outlined in the report and subject to the following additional conditions:

- Re-describe and remove reference to touring caravans.
- Add a personal permission condition.
- That permission is for two park homes only.
- Condition landscaping including means of enclosure.
- Condition regarding a check to ensure that the bank to the rear (north) is stable to enable development to proceed.

Members did also suggest that there were conditions put on for a Construction Management Plan and also that a condition be added to outline that the site is for commercial use only.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 4th February, 2020 at 2.00 pm

Officers outlined that a construction management plan would not be necessary for the scale of development given it would be for the installation of two park homes. It was also outlined that a condition to restrict the use of the site for residential only was unnecessary given that any other use would be contrary to any planning consent and therefore the Council would be able to take appropriate enforcement action to any unauthorised uses.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	9
Against the proposal	-	0
Abstentions	-	4

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01480 be approved subject to the seven conditions outlined in the report and subject to the following additional conditions:

- Re-describe and remove reference to touring caravans.
- Add a personal permission condition.
- That permission is for two park homes only.
- Condition landscaping including means of enclosure.
- Condition regarding a check to ensure that the bank to the rear (north) is stable to enable development to proceed.

9. New Appeals - 21st November 2019 to 27th January 2020

We noted the new appeals received between 21st November 2019 and 27th January 2020.

The meeting ended at 5.00 pm.